### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OKLAHOMA

STATE OF OKLAHOMA,	)
Plaintiff,	) )
v.	Case No. 05-cv-329-GKF(SAJ)
TYSON FOODS, INC., et al.,	)
Defendants.	)

# STATE OF OKLAHOMA'S REPLY TO "GEORGE'S, INC. AND GEORGE'S FARMS, INC.'S RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFF'S MOTION TO EXPAND THE DISCOVERY PERIOD [DKT. #1418]"

Plaintiff, the State of Oklahoma, ex rel. W.A. Drew Edmondson, in his capacity as Attorney General of the State of Oklahoma and Oklahoma Secretary of the Environment C. Miles Tolbert, in his capacity as the Trustee for Natural Resources for the State of Oklahoma ("the State") respectfully replies to "George's, Inc. and George's Farms, Inc.'s Response in Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion to Expand the Discovery Period [DKT. #1418]" [DKT #1646] as follows:

## 1. The State seeks an expansion of the discovery period as to <u>all</u> discovery, not just document discovery

To the extent the George's Defendants suggest that the State is seeking to expand the discovery period only as to document discovery, this suggestion is incorrect, and the State incorporates by reference its argument set out in the "State of Oklahoma's Reply to 'Peterson Farms, Inc.'s Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' [sic] Motion to Expand the Discovery Period, Docket No. 1418." *See* DKT #1665. Thus, even accepting arguendo the George's Defendants' representations that they have produced all of their hard-copy documents pertaining to their operations in the Illinois River Watershed, including their historic operations in the Illinois River

Watershed,<sup>1</sup> the State's Motion does apply to the George's Defendants. Specifically, the State is entitled to deposition testimony and interrogatory answers from the George's Defendants pertaining to their historic operations.<sup>2</sup>

### 2. Information about the George's Defendants' historic operations in the Illinois River Watershed is relevant

The George's Defendants' assertion that the State's Motion does not address the issue of relevance ignores the fact that the State attached to its Motion the affidavit of Shanon J. Phillips, Assistant Division Director of Water Quality Division of the Oklahoma Conservation Commission, which establishes (1) that past poultry waste land application has caused past contamination in the Illinois River Watershed, and (2) that past poultry waste land application is causing present contamination in the Illinois River Watershed. In further response to this frivolous argument by the George's Defendants, the State incorporates by reference the arguments made in the "State of Oklahoma's Reply to 'Peterson Farms, Inc.'s Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' [sic] Motion to Expand the Discovery Period, Docket No. 1418." See DKT #1665. Simply put, information about the George's Defendants' historic operations in the Illinois River Watershed clearly is relevant.

The George's Defendants also represent that they have produced all of their electronically stored information pertaining to their historic operations in the Illinois River Watershed to the extent it was in "a readily accessible electronic form." As explained in *Martin v. Wal-Mart Stores Inc.*, 2007 WL 4374175, \*3 (N.D. Ill. Dec. 4, 2007), however, "discovery is not limited to information that is 'readily accessible." Thus, the George's Defendants' ESI productions are non-compliant.

By way of example and without limitation, the George's Defendants owe the State an answer to its very first interrogatory that is unrestricted by time. That interrogatory sought from the George's Defendants the name and physical location of the George's Defendants' poultry operations, the dates of those operations, the type of those operations, the number of birds (aggregated annually) at those operations, and the name of the owner and operator of those operations.

#### Conclusion

For all the reasons set forth in the State's Motion and above, the State's Motion to Expand the Discovery Period to include all responsive information pertaining to the Illinois River Watershed, regardless of its age, should be granted.

Respectfully Submitted,

W.A. Drew Edmondson OBA # 2628 ATTORNEY GENERAL Kelly H. Burch OBA #17067 J. Trevor Hammons OBA #20234 Tina Lynn Izadi OBA #17978 Daniel P. Lennington OBA #21577 ASSISTANT ATTORNEYS GENERAL State of Oklahoma 313 N.E. 21<sup>st</sup> St. Oklahoma City, OK 73105 (405) 521-3921

#### s/Robert A. Nance

M. David Riggs OBA #7583
Joseph P. Lennart OBA #5371
Richard T. Garren OBA #3253
Douglas A. Wilson OBA #13128
Sharon K. Weaver OBA #19010
David P. Page OBA #6852
Robert A. Nance OBA #6581
D. Sharon Gentry OBA #15641
RIGGS, ABNEY, NEAL, TURPEN,
ORBISON & LEWIS
502 West Sixth Street
Tulsa, OK 74119
(918) 587-3161

Louis W. Bullock OBA #1305 Robert M. Blackmore OBA #18656 BULLOCK BULLOCK & BLAKEMORE 110 West Seventh Street Suite 707 Tulsa OK 74119-1031 (918) 584-2001 Frederick C. Baker (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Lee M. Heath (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Elizabeth C. Ward (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Elizabeth Claire Xidis (admitted *pro hac vice*)
MOTLEY RICE, LLC
28 Bridgeside Boulevard
Mount Pleasant, SC 29465 (843) 216-9280

William H. Narwold (admitted *pro hac vice*) Ingrid L. Moll (admitted *pro hac vice*) MOTLEY RICE, LLC 20 Church Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor Hartford, CT 06103 (860) 882-1676

Jonathan D. Orent (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Michael G. Rousseau (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Fidelma L. Fitzpatrick (admitted *pro hac vice*)
MOTLEY RICE, LLC
321 South Main Street
Providence, RI 02940
(401) 457-7700

Attorneys for the State of Oklahoma

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this  $\underline{4}^{th}$  day of April, 2008, I electronically transmitted the above and foregoing pleading to the Clerk of the Court using the ECF System for filing and a transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing to the following ECF registrants:

W. A. Drew Edmondson, Attorney General Kelly H. Burch, Assistant Attorney General J. Trevor Hammons, Assistant Attorney General Tina Lynn Izadi, Assistant Attorney General Daniel P. Lennington, Assistant Attorney General Fc\_docket@oag.state.ok.us kelly\_burch@oag.state.ok.us trevor\_hammons@oag.state.ok.us tina\_izadi@oag.state.ok.us daniel.lennington@oag.ok.gov M. David Riggs driggs@riggsabney.com Joseph P. Lennart jlennart@riggsabney.com Richard T. Garren rgarren@riggsabney.com Douglas A. Wilson doug\_wilson@riggsabney.com sweaver@riggsabney.com Sharon K. Weaver dpage@riggsabney.com David Page rnance@riggsabney.com Robert A. Nance D. Sharon Gentry sgentry@riggsabney.com

RIGGS, ABNEY, NEAL, TURPEN, ORBISON & LEWIS

Louis W. Bullock Robert M. Blakemore

**BULLOCK BULLOCK & BLAKEMORE** 

lbullock@bullock-blakemore.com rblakemore@bullock-blakemore.com

Frederick C. Baker
Lee M. Heath
Elizabeth C. Ward
Elizabeth Claire Xidis
William H. Narwold
Ingrid L. Moll
Jonathan D. Orent
Michael G. Rousseau
Fidelma L. Fitzpatrick
MOTLEY RICE, LLC

**Counsel for State of Oklahoma** 

fbaker@motleyrice.com lheath@motleyrice.com lward@motleyrice.com cxidis@motleyrice.com bnarwold@motleyrice.com imoll@motleyrice.com jorent@motleyrice.com mrousseau@motleyrice.com ffitzpatrick@motleyrice.com

Robert P. Redemann rredemann@pmrlaw.net
Lawrence W. Zeringue lzeringue@pmrlaw.net
David C. Senger dsenger@pmrlaw.net
PERRINE, MCGIVERN, REDEMANN, REID, BARRY & TAYLOR, P.L.L.C.

Robert E Sanders rsanders@youngwilliams.com
Edwin Stephen Williams steve.williams@youngwilliams.com
YOUNG WILLIAMS P.A.

Counsel for Cal-Maine Farms, Inc and Cal-Maine Foods, Inc.

John H. Tucker jtucker@rhodesokla.com
Theresa Noble Hill thill@rhodesokla.com
Colin Hampton Tucker ctucker@rhodesokla.com
Leslie Jane Southerland ljsoutherland@rhodesokla.com

RHODES, HIERONYMUS, JONES, TUCKER & GABLE

Terry Wayen West terry@thewestlawfirm.com
THE WEST LAW FIRM

Delmar R. Ehrich dehrich@faegre.com
Bruce Jones bjones@faegre.com
Dara D. Mann dmann@faegre.com
Krisann C. Kleibacker Lee kklee@faegre.com
Todd P. Walker twalker@faegre.com

FAEGRE & BENSON, LLP

Counsel for Cargill, Inc. & Cargill Turkey Production, LLC

James Martin Graves
Gary V Weeks
gweeks@bassettlawfirm.com
gweeks@bassettlawfirm.com
paul E. Thompson, Jr
pthompson@bassettlawfirm.com
Woody Bassett
Jennifer E. Lloyd
BASSETT LAW FIRM
jgraves@bassettlawfirm.com
gweeks@bassettlawfirm.com
pthompson@bassettlawfirm.com
jlloyd@bassettlawfirm.com

George W. Owens gwo@owenslawfirmpc.com Randall E. Rose gwo@owenslawfirmpc.com

OWENS LAW FIRM, P.C.

Counsel for George's Inc. & George's Farms, Inc.

A. Scott McDaniel smcdaniel@mhla-law.com
Nicole Longwell nlongwell@mhla-law.com
Philip Hixon phixon@mhla-law.com
Craig A. Merkes cmerkes@mhla-law.com

MCDANIEL, HIXON, LONGWELL & ACORD, PLLC

Sherry P. Bartley sbartley@mwsgw.com MITCHELL, WILLIAMS, SELIG, GATES & WOODYARD, PLLC Counsel for Peterson Farms, Inc.

John Elrod jelrod@cwlaw.com
Vicki Bronson vbronson@cwlaw.com
P. Joshua Wisley jwisley@cwlaw.com
Bruce W. Freeman bfreeman@cwlaw.com
D. Richard Funk rfunk@cwlaw.com
CONNER & WINTERS, LLP

**Counsel for Simmons Foods, Inc.** 

Stephen L. Jantzen sjantzen@ryanwhaley.com
Paula M. Buchwald pbuchwald@ryanwhaley.com
Patrick M. Ryan pryan@ryanwhaley.com

RYAN, WHALEY, COLDIRON & SHANDY, P.C.

Mark D. Hopsonmhopson@sidley.comJay Thomas Jorgensenjjorgensen@sidley.comTimothy K. Webstertwebster@sidley.comThomas C. Greentcgreen@sidley.comGordon D. Toddgtodd@sidley.com

SIDLEY, AUSTIN, BROWN & WOOD LLP

Robert W. George robert.george@kutakrock.com
Michael R. Bond michael.bond@kutakrock.com
Erin W. Thompson
erin.thompson@kutakrock.com

KUTAK ROCK, LLP

Counsel for Tyson Foods, Inc., Tyson Poultry, Inc., Tyson Chicken, Inc., & Cobb-Vantress, Inc.

R. Thomas Lay rtl@kiralaw.com

KERR, IRVINE, RHODES & ABLES

Jennifer Stockton Griffin jgriffin@lathropgage.com

David Gregory Brown LATHROP & GAGE LC

Counsel for Willow Brook Foods, Inc.

Robin S Conrad rconrad@uschamber.com

NATIONAL CHAMBER LITIGATION CENTER

Gary S Chilton gchilton@hcdattorneys.com

HOLLADAY, CHILTON AND DEGIUSTI, PLLC

**Counsel for US Chamber of Commerce and American Tort Reform Association** 

D. Kenyon Williams, Jr. kwilliams@hallestill.com Michael D. Graves mgraves@hallestill.com

Hall, Estill, Hardwick, Gable, Golden & Nelson

Counsel for Poultry Growers/Interested Parties/ Poultry Partners, Inc.

Richard Ford richard.ford@crowedunlevy.com
LeAnne Burnett leanne.burnett@crowedunlevy.com

Crowe & Dunlevy

Counsel for Oklahoma Farm Bureau, Inc.

Kendra Akin Jones, Assistant Attorney General Charles L. Moulton, Sr Assistant Attorney General

Jessica E. Rainey Barry G. Reynolds TITUS HILLIS REYNOLD LOVE DICKMAN & McCALMON Kendra.Jones@arkansasag.gov Charles.Moulton@arkansasag.gov jrainey@titushillis.com

reynolds@titushillis.com

William S. Cox, III wcox@lightfootlaw.com Nikaa Baugh Jordan njordan@lightfootlaw.com

LIGHTFOOT, FRANLIN & WHITE

**Counsel for American Farm Bureau Federation and the National Cattlemen's Beef Association** 

John D. Russell jrussell@fellerssnider.com

FELLERS, SNIDERS, BLAKENSHIP,

BAILEY & TIPPENS, P.C.

William A. Waddell, Jr. waddell@fec.net
David E. Choate dehoate@fec.net

FRIDAY, ELDREDGE & CLARK, LLP

**Counsel for Amicus Curiae Arkansas Farm Bureau Federation** 

Mia Vahlberg @gablelaw.com

**GABLE GOTWALS** 

Adam J. Siegel ajsiegel@hhlaw.com
James T. Banks jtbanks@hhlaw.com

HOGAN & HARTSON, LLP

Counsel for National Chicken Counsel, U.S. Poultry & Egg Association and National Turkey Federation (collectively "Amici Curiae")

M. Richard Mullins richard.mullins@mcafeetaft.com

MCAFEE & TAFT

Counsel for Texas Farm Bureau, Texas Cattle Feeders Association Texas Pork Producers Association and Texas Association of Dairymen

Also on this  $\underline{4^{th}}$  day of April, 2008, I mailed a copy of the above and foregoing pleading to the following:

#### **David Gregory Brown**

Lathrop & Gage, LC 314 E. High Street Jefferson City, MO 65101

#### Thomas C. Green

Sidley Austin Brown & Wood, LLP 1501 K St. NW Washington, DC 20005

#### **Cary Silverman**

Victor E. Schwartz Shook Hardy & Bacon LLP 600 14<sup>th</sup> St. NW, Ste. 800 Washington, DC 20005-2004

#### C. Miles Tolbert

Secretary of the Environment State of Oklahoma 3800 North Classen Oklahoma City, OK 73118

#### Gary V. Weeks

Bassett Law Firm P.O. Box 3618 Fayetteville, AR 72702

### **Dustin McDaniel**

**Justin Allen** 

Office of the Attorney General (Little Rock) 323 Center Street, Suite 200 Little Rock, AR 72201-2610

s/Robert A. Nance
Robert A. Nance